The Presence of Asbestos in the Natural Environment is Likely Related to Mesothelioma in Young Individuals and Women from Southern Nevada

Francine Baumann, PhD,* Brenda J. Buck, PhD,† Rodney V. Metcalf, PhD,† Brett T. McLaurin, PhD,‡ Douglas J. Merkler, MSc,§ and Michele Carbone, MD, PhD*

Background: Inhalation of asbestos and other mineral fibers is known causes of malignant mesothelioma (MM) and lung cancers. In a setting of occupational exposure to asbestos, MM occurs four to eight times more frequently in men than in women, at the median age of 74 years, whereas an environmental exposure to asbestos causes the same number of MMs in men and women, at younger ages. Methods: We studied the geology of Nevada to identify mineral fibers in the environment. We compared MM mortality in different Nevada counties, per sex and age group, for the 1999 to 2010 period. Results: We identified the presence of carcinogenic minerals in Nevada, including actinolite asbestos, erionite, winchite, magnesio-ribeckite, and richterite. We discovered that, compared with the United States and other Nevada counties, Clark and Nye counties, in southern Nevada, had a significantly higher proportion of MM that occurred in young individuals (≤55 years) and in women. Conclusions: The elevated percentage of women and individuals younger than 55 years old, combined with a sex ratio of 1:1 in this age group and the presence of naturally occurring asbestos, suggests that environmental exposure to mineral fibers in southern Nevada may be contributing to some of these mesotheliomas. Further research to assess environmental exposures should allow the development of strategies to minimize exposure, as the development of rural areas continues in Nevada, and to prevent MM and other asbestos-related diseases.

Key Words: Mesothelioma, Environmental exposure, Asbestos, Lung cancer, Mineral fibers.

(J Thorac Oncol. 2015;10: 731–737)
in the Cappadocia region of Turkey,16–19 exposure to the amphibole minerals winchite, richterite, and magnesio-ribeckite at Libby, Montana, United States20–25; and exposure to antigorite in New Caledonia.8,15 All these exposure have been linked to the development of MM in humans. These mineral fibers share some physical and biological properties that are thought to contribute to their carcinogenicity, such as a fibrous shape (length/ diameter [aspect] ratio >3:1), a high surface area, and a width of less than 0.25 μm,26 because ultrathin fibers are more likely to reach the pleura27 and to resist biological degradation.28,29

Naturally occurring asbestos (NOA) is a term used to describe fibrous minerals that may or may not meet the regulatory definitions of asbestos but are natural components of rocks and soils.30 Areas with NOA in soils and sediments are a potential source of exposure for nearby populations especially if these fibers become airborne through natural erosion or human activities producing dust: mines, quarries, roads, and outside activities.31 Increasing road traffic in rural areas and other dust producing activities are also causing exposure to NOA to a growing number of people.8,18 In arid and semiarid climates, natural wind erosion can be a significant process for dust emissions, which can increase fiber exposures.31 Such exposures can occur since birth, resulting in MM in young individuals, in both genders.32,33 NOA presents a significant health risk primarily where the close proximity of NOA occurrences to large populations provides a pathway for human exposure.

Because of both anecdotal reports of MM in young individuals in southern Nevada and the recent finding of NOA in soil, dust, and air near the Las Vegas metropolitan area,34,35 we tested the hypothesis that MM would be increased in that region in a pattern consistent with environmental exposure.

**MATERIALS AND METHODS**

We studied several health indicators suggestive of a possible environmental exposure to carcinogenic mineral fibers, including increased proportion of female MMs and a higher percentage of MM in individuals under the age of 55 years.

We analyzed MM mortality data obtained from the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) in United States for the period 1999 to 2010, by gender, by age group, and by county, which included a total of 31,526 MM cases. We also used data from the CDC to study MM incidence and death rates by state and by gender.36 Because MM is a rare disease, confidence intervals (CIs) per county and per age groups were calculated assuming that the MM cases followed a Poisson distribution. Because of the small numbers, we grouped the two southern counties of Clark and Nye, defined here as southern Nevada, and compared the proportion of women and of young cases (<55 years old) in these two southern counties to those in all other Nevada counties grouped together. Percentages were compared between southern Nevada, all other Nevada counties, and all other U.S. counties, by using the Pearson χ² test with Yates correction or Fisher’s exact test when the expected numbers were less than five, and were considered statistically significant when the p value was less than 0.05. Incidence and death rates are given with their 95% CI.

We compiled and integrated known presence of fibrous minerals in Nevada from published sources.19,34,35,37–39 We used population data by county from the 2010 census (accessible at: http://www2.census.gov/geo/maps/dc10_thematic/2010_Profile/2010_Profile_Map_Nevada.pdf) to better interpret the potential for populations to come in contact with naturally occurring carcinogenic fibrous minerals. The 2010 census measured just over 2.7 million people in the state, with 74% living in Clark and Nye counties, southern Nevada (http://censusviewer.com/state/NV). The vast majority of the population in southern Nevada and the largest concentration of people in the entire state live in the Las Vegas metropolitan area. This includes the cities of Las Vegas, Henderson, North Las Vegas, and Boulder City with a population of over 1.9 million. Washoe County in northwestern Nevada has the next highest population, with over 400,000 people. Vast areas of central and northern Nevada have fewer than one person per square mile.

**RESULTS**

**Mesothelioma Rates in Nevada**

For the 2006 to 2010 period, Nevada has a global MM age-standardized incidence rate of 10 cases per million inhabitants per year (95% CI: 8–12).36 This rate is similar to the mean U.S. rate (10 per million; 95% CI: 10–10) and places Nevada in a middle position among the states for MM incidence (minimum, 5 [Hawaii]; maximum, 15 [Alaska and Maine] MM cases per million in 2006–2010).36 Nevada is not listed among the 15 states having produced asbestos or showing a high occupational exposure;68; thus a standardized MM incidence of 10 per million in this state is unexpectedly high, compared with the background MM incidence of 5 per million in other U.S. states without known occupational exposure.5,36

The analysis of all MM deaths recorded in Nevada for the 1999 to 2010 period shows a constant mortality rate over these 12 years. To respect confidentiality, we cannot show detailed data per subgroup. In all Nevada counties, excluding the southern Nevada counties of Clark and Nye, the MM M/F ratio was 6.33:1, as expected when MM occurs prevalently in a setting of occupational exposure (Table 2). In contrast, in southern Nevada (Clark and Nye counties), the MM M/F ratio was significantly lower (2.69:1; p = 0.0468; Table 2). The southern Nevada MM sex ratio was also significantly lower compared with the United States (4.97:1; p = 0.0422; Table 2). The low sex ratio of MM in the southern Nevada counties cannot be explained by the characteristics of this population; the percentage of women was exactly the same (49.1% in 2000) in Clark and Nye counties and all other Nevada counties.

The percentage of MMs in individuals younger than 55 years—a possible indicator of environmental exposure—was significantly higher in the southern Nevada counties (11.28%) than in all other U.S. counties (6.21%; p = 0.0249; Table 2). These young cases were residents of Clark and Nye counties, southern Nevada, where we identified 21 MMs with a M/F ratio of 1:1 (11 males and 10 females), and the youngest cases being recorded in the age group of 15–19 years. No difference in the population distribution per age groups could explain the increased rate of young MM cases in Clark and Nye counties; compared with the other Nevada counties, in 2000, the 0–54 years age group in Clark
Indicators of Environmental Exposure to Mineral Fibers

Naturally Occurring Carcinogenic Fibrous Minerals in Nevada

We compiled all published data about the presence of fibrous mineral, including asbestos minerals and erionite, in Nevada. To evaluate potential environmental exposures to fibrous minerals, we have integrated these data and mapped their distribution in relation to populations in Nevada (Figs. 1 and 2). The list of carcinogenic mineral fibers detected in Nevada is shown in Table 1.

Attempts to map the distribution of the fibrous actinolite resulted in the identification of 230 samples of asbestos-bearing rock and soil in Clark County (Fig. 2). Most of these sites were the result of the analyses performed for planning the construction of the Boulder City Bypass/Interstate 11.

Fibrous winchite, magnesioriebeckite, actinolite, and richterite were identified across the Colorado River in northwestern Arizona (Fig. 3). These are the same fibrous minerals present in Libby, Montana, where they were related to MM and other asbestos-related diseases. As with the southern Nevada locality, weathering and erosion have distributed the fibrous amphiboles in adjacent alluvial fans, greatly increasing the areal distribution (Fig. 2).

Environmental exposure to mineral fibers can happen when human activities and natural processes, such as wind or water, release fibers in the air. When these processes occur, increasing number of people are exposed. In Nevada, carcinogenic fibrous minerals are located in and around residential areas (including the Las Vegas metropolitan area), in areas typically used for outdoor recreation, such as the Lake Mead National Recreation Area.

Moreover, desert dust storms can carry fibers and cause human exposure. Although dust storms, such as those that frequently hit Arizona, are less frequent in Nevada, impressive dust clouds resulting from local wind erosion can...
be observed at any time during the year (Fig. 3). Prevailing wind directions and speeds are variable throughout the year, with the highest winds in the spring primarily from the south, southwest, or southeast.40 These wind directions and arid landscape greatly increase the potential for NOA to be blown from source areas (Fig. 2) into the Las Vegas Basin and cause human exposure.

DISCUSSION

Because occupational exposure to asbestos is less frequent in women than in men, MM rates in women, and particularly a low M/F ratio, are sensitive indicators to identify environmental exposures to asbestos and other mineral fibers. This strategy was successfully applied in New Caledonia to identify environmental exposure to antigorite as the cause of a MM epidemic.15,33 Compared with the entire United States, southern Nevada showed a significantly higher proportion of MM in women. In particular, the two counties Clark and Nye had a low M/F MM ratio of 2.69:1, a result suggestive of nonoccupational exposure to carcinogenic mineral fibers, whereas the other Nevada counties had a M/F ratio of 6.33:1, indicating occupational exposure to asbestos, similar to seven U.S. states with asbestos industry and workers occupationally exposed to asbestos. The elevated rates of MM in individuals younger than 55 years old, combined with a sex ratio of 1:1 in this age group, suggests that an environmental exposure to mineral fibers is occurring in southern Nevada and may be causing some of these MM.

Women and children can be exposed to fibrous minerals as a result of their husband’s or father’s occupational exposure when bringing these fibers home on their clothes. However, in southern Nevada there are no major asbestos industries, thus this seems an unlikely hypothesis. Instead, the presence of asbestos and other fibers in the environment of Clark and Nye counties, where a lower M/F ratio and an increased proportion of MM are seen in young individuals, suggests that some of these MMs are caused by environmental exposure.

Some of the known sources of carcinogenic fibrous minerals in Nevada occur in unpopulated areas in north and central portions of the state, others near the Las Vegas metropolitan area (Fig. 1). In Washoe County, which is the second highest populated Nevada County, there are no known areas containing asbestos in the environment and one single locality containing erionite. We did not find any epidemiological indication of environmental exposure to carcinogenic mineral fibers in Washoe County. Instead, in southern Nevada, the Las Vegas metropolitan area has 1.9 million people either in direct contact with NOA or residing in areas that for part of the year are downwind from NOA sources (Figs. 1 and 2). Portions of the Las Vegas metropolitan area have the regulated asbestos mineral actinolite present in rock, soil, and air.34,38–40

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mineral Name</th>
<th>Commercial Name</th>
<th>Mineral Group</th>
<th>Present in Southern Nevada</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Riebeckite</td>
<td>Crocidolite</td>
<td>Amphibole</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anthophyllite</td>
<td>Amphibole</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grunerite–Cummingtonite</td>
<td>Amosite</td>
<td>Amphibole</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tremolite</td>
<td>Amphibole</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Actinolite</td>
<td>Amphibole</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chrysotile</td>
<td>Serpentine</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erionite</td>
<td>Zeolite</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winchite</td>
<td>Amphibole</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richterite</td>
<td>Amphibole</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magnesioriebeckite</td>
<td>Amphibole</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antigorite</td>
<td>Serpentine</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*The six mineral fibers that comprise the “asbestos” family. These are the only type of fibers whose use is strictly regulated in the United States, Europe, and several other countries.

FIGURE 2. Southern Clark County, Nevada and western Mohave County, Arizona. Occurrences of fibrous minerals are shown as red squares. Occurrences compiled from Buck et al.34 Tetra Tech, Kleinfelder,20 2014, and Metcalf and Buck.35
addition, fibrous winchite, magnesioriebeckite, actinolite, and richterite are present in a large area just across the Colorado River in northwestern Arizona \(^{34}\) (Fig. 2). At this time, erionite is known to occur in southern Nevada only near the small community of Beatty, and at the Nevada National Security Site (formerly the Nevada Test Site; Fig. 1).

The rock and soils that contain the amphibole NOA make up a very large area in southern Nevada and northwestern Arizona that include urban areas (e.g., Boulder City) and rural areas where people routinely enjoy outdoor activities including horseback riding, running, hiking, bicycling, and off-road vehicle (ORV) recreation. It has been estimated that in Nevada over 15% of the population engages in ORV recreation every year. \(^{31}\) Airborne dust is a common phenomenon in this region because of the aridity. \(^{42}\) When desert pavements are disturbed by activities, such as horseback riding and especially ORV recreation, large quantities of dust containing fibers are released into the air by wind erosion. \(^{31,34}\)

One common area for ORV recreation in Nevada is the Eldorado Dry Lake, which lies south of Henderson and west of Boulder City (Fig. 2). The dry lake bed is a known source of fibrous amphiboles. \(^{34}\) This dry lake bed produces significant dust during windy days and/or as the result of ORV and other recreational activities. To protect the population from environmental exposure to mineral fibers, similar ORV recreation areas have been restricted in California. \(^{43}\) All these recreational activities can cause fibers to become airborne and to attach to clothing, equipment, and cars where they are then potentially brought into homes where secondary exposures to other family members can occur.

Airborne asbestos fibers have been measured in Clark County. \(^{33,38}\) Dust samples were collected along dirt roads as drivers drove past in Boulder City and in the McCullough Range, and ambient dust was collected in the backyard of a Boulder City resident. In all samples, fibrous amphiboles were present. \(^{34}\) Ambient air measurements were taken at four locations near Railroad Pass (between Boulder City and Henderson) over a 3-month period (May 8–August 9, 2014) and detected asbestos fibers in the air. \(^{38}\)

We considered factors that could have led to false-positive results. First, Nevada is a destination for retirement, and people could have been exposed elsewhere and developed MM in Nevada. However, by focusing on MM rates in young individuals, we decreased the risk that the results were influenced by asbestos workers who may have retired in Nevada. Second, another possible source of exposure to asbestos may occur in old buildings. Several old hotels and casinos were demolished in Las Vegas during the past 20 years, raising some concern about possible exposure to asbestos for the residents during the demolition. However, because MMs have a 30-year to 50-year mean latency from exposure, it is unlikely that the MM rates we detected in Nevada were influenced by this factor. Third, there is no significant asbestos trade in Nevada. Thus, indirect exposure through family members involved in asbestos trades seems an unlikely explanation for the higher MM rates in women and young individuals. Lung content analyses to investigate for the presence, type, and amounts of carcinogenic mineral fibers in the lungs of MM cases are needed to further prove causality. Future research should try to address whether the relative increase in MM incidence that we observed in women and young adults is related to specific types of mineral fibers among the several fiber types we detected in Southern Nevada (Table 1). We also need to investigate whether individual traits,
such as genetics, are responsible for MM development in some of these individuals or whether MM is simply because of exposure since childhood. Precise information about women and young individuals who developed MM, including their residential history and activities that may increase their exposure to dust and fibers, will allow to study whether the overall amount of environmental exposure (measured in years of exposure and in activities that may increase exposure, such as ORV use) and/or its discontinuation influences the incidence or latency of MM in these cohorts.

In summary, in Clark and Nye Counties, southern Nevada, the significantly higher proportion of MM under the age of 55 years and the high proportion of MM in women suggest a nonoccupational exposure to mineral fibers from early age. Known sources of carcinogenic fibrous minerals in southern Nevada region include the regulated actinolite asbestos, and winchite, magnesioriebeckite, and richterite, which are largely the same minerals responsible for the disease epidemic in Libby Montana. Erionite is also present, but currently it has been identified in only two localities, both of which are farther away from large populations when compared with the fibrous amphibole localities (Fig. 1). This arid region usually experiences dust storms and is popular for ORV and other recreational activities that increase human exposures to mineral dusts. The results herein suggest that further research is needed, including epidemiological, geological, mineralogical, and health-based personal exposure studies, to characterize the residential and occupational history of the MM cases we studied, to highlight the highest risk areas within Clark and Nye Counties, to identify the type of fibrous minerals and their precise distribution throughout Nevada, and to identify the activities responsible for the release of fibers in the air, which may be the cause of some of the MM in this region. A precise knowledge of where these carcinogenic fibers occur, what causes their release in the air, and the history of possible environmental exposure of the MM cases we detected will provide essential information to prevent future exposure in the population as the major development of rural areas continues in Nevada. The design of new highways and human settlements, for example, should keep this information into consideration to decrease the risk of MM and other asbestos-related diseases caused by asbestos and other mineral fibers present in the environment.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The authors thank Dr. David Weisman of the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) for providing the MM mortality data. We also thank Dr. Aubrey Miller and Dr. Christopher Weis of the National Institute of Environmental Health Science and National Institutes of Health, Dr. David Weisman and Dr. John Wood of the CDC, Dr. James Lockey of the University of Cincinnati, Dr. Patrick Ryan of the Cincinnati Children’s Hospital Medical Center, and Dr. W. Martin Kast for their constructive comments and review.

REFERENCES